REVIEW
of the official reviewer on the thesis work of
Zaland Faiz Muhammad on the theme "Peace-building process in Afghanistan: Political power distribution and it's future", submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the speciality "8D03104-Political Sciences".

№п/п	Criteria	Eligibility (one of the answer options must be checked)	Justification of the position of the official reviewer
1.	The topic of the thesis (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programmes	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of scientific development or state programmes::	
		1) The dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target programme financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or programme) 2) The dissertation was completed within the framework of another state programme (specify the name of the programme) **3) The thesis corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction)**	The thesis corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan – "Research in the field of social sciences and humanities".
2.	The importance for science	The work **does**/does not make a **significant contribution** to science and its importance is **well-disclosed**/not disclosed	The research contributes to the existing body of knowledge in terms of methodology, and empirical findings. The study attempts to provide empirical data explaining the main factors that led to the failure of the U.S. government and the international community's peace-building efforts in Afghanistan. An extensive systematic analysis of scientific literature has been conducted in seven blocks, which focus on the psychological impact of wars and rebellions, as well as the impact of wars and revolutions on society and hybrid forms of the world, it presents the main bibliometric analytical descriptions, including the year of publication, journal,

			author, affiliation, keywords, and geographical location
3.	The principle of independence	Self-reliance level: 1) High; **2) Medium;** 3) Low; 4) No autonomy	The results presented in the Zaland Faiz Mukhammad's dissertation were obtained personally by the author with his direct participation in empirical research and discussions. However, secondary sources are also used in the dissertation.
4.	The principle of internal unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis: **1) Justified;** 2) Partially justified; 3) Not substantiated.	The relevance of the thesis is well justified. The relevance of research is beyond any doubt. Peace-building process in Afghanistan and related issues of security one of the widely discussed topic in Central Asian expert circles as well as in public space.
		4.2 The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis: **1) Reflects;** 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect	The topic of the dissertation is disclosed in the content of the work. The research is effectively based within the existing theoretical body of knowledge, and the rationalization is well grounded. The author of the work justifies the selection for studying the research methodology and Data collection.
		4.3 The aim and objectives are consistent with the thesis topic: **1) correspond to;** 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond	The introduction of the thesis outlines the study purpose and objectives, while Chapter 2 of the dissertation is devoted to setting the theoretical framework of the study, which includes a more detailed discussion of objectives and research questions. The doctoral student provides arguments that support the relevance of the research topic.
		4.4 All sections and statements of the thesis are logically interrelated: 1) **fully interrelated;** 2) partially interrelated;	All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically interconnected. By clearly identifying the problem statement and

		3) no interrelation	objectives of the thesis, the author of the research manages to build the relevant theoretical framework/ Chapters are presented in a logical order, with all sections and subsections flowing from each other in a clear and logical way.
		4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are argued and evaluated in comparison with known solutions: 1) **critical analysis is;** 2) the analysis is partial; 3) the analysis is not the author's own opinions, but quotes from other authors	The author justifies the choice of theories, variables, and methods. In the systematic literature review part, the author analyzed prior literature and identified literature gap that the current study intends to fill in. In terms of the selection of data and methods of examination the author also presented justification and comparison with prior literature.
5.	Principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and statements new? 1) completely new; 2) **partially new (25-75% are new);** 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The author of the thesis clearly highlights the novelty of the thesis by presenting following arguments: the study attempts to provide empirical data explaining the main factors that led to the failure of the U.S. government and the international community's peace-building efforts in Afghanistan; the research analyzed empirical data on the ground in Afghanistan, as well as conducted interviews with experts throughout the country and abroad; this scientific study provides specific recommendations for future peace-building efforts in Afghanistan and any other country facing attempts at external State-building through military invasion
		5. 2 Are the conclusions of the thesis new? 1) completely new; **2) partially new (25-75% are new);**	The research is performed by applying multiple estimation techniques,

		3) not new (less than 25% are new)	analytical tools to highlight the reliability of the main findings.
		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and justified: **1) completely new;** 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	Technical, technological, economic or management solutions are new and justified. The study has implications for various stakeholders in peacebuilding, whether they are countries at war, residents, international organizations, or Governments. The results of this study may also provide policymakers and political leaders with more information needed to promote peacebuilding in war-torn and conflict-prone countries such as Afghanistan.
6.	The validity of the main conclusions	**All major conclusions are**/are not based on scientifically rigorous evidence **or are reasonably well supported (for qualitative research and arts and humanities training areas)**	All major conclusions are reasonably well supported for qualitative research in Political Sciences.
7.	The main assumptions submitted to the thesis defense	The following questions should be answered for each provision separately: 7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven; **2) rather proven;** 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven 7.2 Is the provision trivial? 1) yes; **2) no** 7.3 Is it new? **1) yes;** 2) no 7.4 The level for the application is: 1) narrow; **2) medium;** 3) broad 7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) **yes;**	Almost all the main assumptions submitted to the thesis defense have been proven. 7.1.**rather proven;** based on comprehensive analysis of related concepts. 7.2 n**ot trivial;** the results of this study may also enable the international community to recognize important factors critical to the success of peacebuilding in conflict and post-conflict situations. 7.3. It is new because of it includes updated new empirical findings that allow for a new assessment of approaches to peacebuilding in Afghanistan. 7.4. The level for the application is **medium.** Due to the specifics of socio-

		2) no	political development and the situation in different regions of the world, the conclusions drawn from Afghanistan cannot be generalized in such a way as to be applied to analyses of conflicts in other regions. 7.5. Yes. Zalan F.The Conflicting Synthesis of the Taliban's Religious and Cultural Identity// The Review of Faith & International Affairs, 21(3), 38–45. https://doi.org/10.1080/15570274.2023.2235840; Neo-Taliban? Thinking Through Typological Differences.// The Review of Faith & International Affairs, 21(3), 46–54 https://doi.org/10.1080/15570274.2023.2235838
8.	Principle of credibility Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 Choice of methodology - justified or methodology is sufficiently detailed **1) yes;** 2) no	The choice of methodology is well justified and described in sufficient detail.
		8.2 The results of the thesis work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and techniques of data processing and interpretation with the use of computer technologies: **1) yes;** 2) no	The results of the thesis work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and techniques of data processing and interpretation with the use of computer technologies. systematic literary review was conducted based on a bibliometric analysis of 2,291 articles using Bib-Excel, as well as a content analysis. An expert survey was conducted (using the Delphi method); the

			sample consisted of 86 experts in the field of conflict, peacebuilding, socio-political and military context of Afghanistan. Structured and unstructured methods of interviewing 507 respondents were carried out.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified interrelationships and regularities are proved and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences the results are proved on the basis of pedagogical experiment): **1) yes;** 2) no	Theoretical conclusions, models, identified interrelationships and regularities are proved and confirmed by quantitative and qualitative research approaches.
		8.4 **Important statements are supported**/partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature	Throughout the thesis, the author supports the selected theoretical provisions, methodology? And obtained results by referring to reliable and updated scientific literature
		8.5 **Literature sources used are sufficient/**not sufficient for the literature review	The literature review conducted by the author is sufficient/ Literature gaps are also identified.
9	The principle of practical value	9.1 The thesis is of theoretical significance: 1) **yes;** 2) no	The information contained in this study can be used to extract specific and applicable lessons on four interrelated theoretical topics: "the complexities of peacebuilding" in Afghanistan, "counterinsurgency", "democratization of warlords" and the failure of intra-Afghan peace negotiations.
		9.2 The thesis is of practical significance and there is a high probability that the findings will be applied in practice: 1) **yes;** 2) no	The practical significance of the study can be proved by fact that this study have shown that many peace-building efforts are not achieving their goals.
		9.3 Are the suggestions for practice new? 1) completely new; **2) partially new (25-75% are new);** 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The results of this study may also enable the international community to recognize important factors critical to the success of peacebuilding in conflict and post-conflict situations.

10.	Quality of writing and design	The quality of academic writing is: 1) **high;** 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	A well-written academic quality is observed throughout the thesis, with all important points clearly presented and understandable to readers from different academic fields and professional backgrounds.

To sum up, the dissertation of Zaland Faiz Muhammad on the topic "Peace-building process in Afghanistan: Political power distribution and it's future", submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the Educational Program 8D03104-Political Sciences" fully complies with the requirements of the Rules for awarding degrees, and the author deserves to be awarded the required degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Political Sciences.

Official reviewer

Nur-Mubarak Egyptian University of Islamic culture, Abdilhakim Burkhanadin Sharafutdinuly

Associate professor, Ph.D.

20 /06/2024